

RI EARLY LEARNING & DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS



The Rhode Island Department of Education (RIDE)

2015 Early Learning and Development Standards Curriculum Alignment



RIDE Rhode Island
Department
of Education

Table of Contents

Introduction	Page 3
Purpose	Page 3
Target Audience	Page 3
Process	Page 3
Research Informing the Process Design	Page 4
Curriculum Review Committee	Page 5
Submissions	Page 6
Rhode Island’s Definition of Curriculum	Page 9
How to Use and Interpret These Findings	Page 10
Evaluation Criteria and Scores	Page 11
Conclusion	Page 37
Appendix	Page 38
Full Table of Scores	Page 38
Program Examples	Page 40
Resources	Page 42
References	Page 43

Introduction

Purpose

The Curriculum Alignment report provides information and guidance to help programs select high quality, research-based published curricula aligned to the Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards and Rhode Island’s definition of curriculum. Included in this report are descriptions of the eight indicators used to define an effective, comprehensive curriculum aligned to each of the twelve curriculums submitted for review. Within each indicator section, curricula have been organized in descending order based on their respective score for the indicator. The report intends to provide useful information to program leaders for the purposes of making curricular decisions for their program.

Target Audience

This report has been primarily designed for program leaders working in early learning programs, including community based early learning programs, state funded Pre-K’s, family child care providers, and public schools. The report may also be used by professional development, higher education, and technical assistance providers as a resource.

Process

Historically, RIDE has supported programs in developing their own program- and classroom-level curricula through professional development and technical assistance. While in-house development of curriculum is still a predominant approach in RI, RIDE recognizes that this is not the only approach and that a growing number of programs have looked to commercial curricula to support their program goals. Acknowledging this fact, the Department began a Request for Proposals (RFP) process in which it looked at vendor/publisher developed curricula and their alignment to the 2013 Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards. Furthermore, a variety of other factors influenced the

decision to identify aligned curricula, including (1) the 2013 revision and expansion of the RIELDS provided a key opportunity for alignments between curricula to be conducted, (2) the rapid expansion of the curriculum market has resulted in many more curricular choices than when the original Standards were developed in 2003, and (3) through the significant quality improvement efforts during the state's Race to the Top- Early Learning Challenge Grant the need to provide additional information to programs to develop quality improvement plans around curriculum was deemed necessary.

The Departments curriculum alignment process review process originally began in the spring of 2013 with a survey which was sent to the field soliciting information on currently used pre-purchased curricula. The intent of the survey was to gather information which would help inform which vendors/publishers were invited to submit alignments for review. During the 2013 solicitation a total of 12 vendors were asked to participate and 7 vendors submitted their curricula for review. In the solicitation vendors were asked to provide a detailed technical report showing the corresponding alignment between their curriculum and the Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards. Additional information was requested including full copies of the curricula, any associated child assessment tools, research and validation studies. A second Request for Proposals was released spring of 2015 with an additional review occurring summer 2015. An additional 7 vendors responded and submitted either revised versions or new materials for review. A full list of vendors submitting can be found on page 17.

Research Informing the Process Design

Evidence has accumulated about the value of high-quality, well-planned curriculum. In recent years reports have highlighted that children are capable of learning more complex language, concepts, and skills than had been previously thought (National Research Council (NRC) 2000; Institute of Medicine 2000; National Research Council 2001; Committee for Economic Development 2002). In each developmental area

new research (National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC) & International Reading Association 1998; NRC 1998; NAEYC & National Council of Teachers of Mathematics 2002) has begun to describe the sequences in which children become increasingly knowledgeable and competent. This research is increasingly helpful in designing well planned, evidence- based curriculum.

Rhode Island's curriculum review process and indicators have been informed by national organizations indicators of effectiveness including the National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC) and the National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER). For example, NAEYC has outlined that effective curricula are evidence based, benefit all children, are comprehensive, ensure children are actively engaged, have clear goals which are shared by all etc.

Curriculum Review Committee

The Curriculum Review Committee met for the purpose of reviewing curricula submitted by the vendors/publishers. Each reviewed received the alignment document, a Department developed rubric, and had access to the full curriculum. Each member conducted a detailed, independent review of specific domains, as well as an overarching review of the curriculum. Each individual score was used for the purposes of discussion and upon completion the team settled upon one consensus, average score. The review committee consisted of the following members:

2013 Review

- Allison Comport- Early Childhood Education Specialist, Early Learning Standards (RIDE)
- Kristen Greene- Early Childhood Education Specialist, State Funded Pre-K (RIDE)
- Judi Stevenson-Garcia- Education Specialist, Child Assessment and Screening (RIDE)

- Ruth Gallucci- Education Specialist, Public School Special Education (RIDE)
- Sara Mickelson- Education Specialist, Professional Development (RIDE)

2015 Review

- Allison Comport- Early Childhood Education Specialist, Early Learning Standards (RIDE)
- Kristen Greene- Early Childhood Education Specialist, State Funded Pre-K (RIDE)
- Judi Stevenson-Garcia- Education Specialist, Child Assessment and Screening (RIDE)
- Sara Mickelson- Education Specialist, Professional Development (RIDE)
- Elaine Remillard- Professional Development Coordinator (RIDE)

Submissions

Curricula	Age Group	Description of the Curriculum*	Publisher
HighScope Infant, Toddler and Preschool	Children aged birth through five	HighScope is a complete curricular system which includes defined curriculum content areas for each topic and age group, assessment tools and a training model. The practices and content are flexible by design and stated to be easily adapted to individual needs and institutional requirements.	HighScope Educational Research Foundation
Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Preschool three and prekindergarten four classes	Creative Curriculum is a curriculum system that offers step-by-step guidance on curriculum, assessment, professional development and family connections through the use of Teaching Guides.	Teaching Strategies, LLC
Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd and 3rd edition	Infants and Toddlers Birth to age three	A curriculum system that offers step-by-step guidance on curriculum, assessment, professional development and family connections through the use of Teaching Guides.	Teaching Strategies, LLC
Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care, 2nd edition	Infants, toddlers, preschoolers and school age children birth through twelve	A curriculum system that offers step-by-step guidance on curriculum, assessment, professional development and family connections through the use of Teaching Guides.	Teaching Strategies, LLC
Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Children age three through five	Tools of the Mind (TOM) is a curriculum program that focusses on the promotion of intentional and self-regulated learning in preschool- and kindergarten-aged children. Tools' instructional philosophy is inspired by the work of Russian psychologist Lev Vygotsky and grounded in a focus on self-regulation/executive functions in children.	Tools of Mind, 6th edition
Open the World of	Children three through	Opening the World of Learning is a comprehensive curriculum	Pearson

Learning (OWL)	five	that covers all domains of early learning. The content of each unit is built around a daily routine within an activity-center day. Themes, skills, and concepts are developed through children's fiction and nonfiction trade books.	
Mother Goose Time for Preschoolers and Little Goose Time**	Children 2 ½ to five years of age	Mother Goose Time is a preschool system with monthly thematic units which come with daily lesson plans, classroom displays, games, music, storybooks, family newsletters and a variety of project supplies for each child. The system features embedded assessment and scaffolded activity ideas.	Experience Early Learning
Big Day for Pre-K	Preschoolers ages three and four	Big Day for Pre-K is a pre-packaged curriculum which includes detailed lesson plans, books and teaching materials connected to lessons for each day.	Scholastic
Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Three and four year old's	Curiosity Corner-2 is designed to provide a foundation in language and literacy, mathematics, science, listening and social skills, creative expression, and positive self-esteem through a holistic, thematic approach to instruction.	Success for All
We Can Early Learning Curriculum	Four to five year olds	Can curriculum is a comprehensive curriculum that incorporates teaching and practice across ten early childhood domains. We Can emphasizes vocabulary word knowledge and the development of oral language.	Voyager Early Learning

* Descriptions of curriculums presented above come directly from the vendor’s submitted materials and/or website.

** Little Goose Time was reviewed; however, it was decided not to independently score this resource. Little Goose Time is not a comprehensive infant and toddler curriculum, but rather an add-on resource to the primary preschool curriculum. As a result, the Little Goose Time materials do not meet the review team’s definition of a curriculum.

Rhode Island’s Definition of Curriculum

A curriculum was included in this report if it met the states definition of Curriculum. Within the RI Early Learning and Development Standards (RIELDS), curriculum is defined as “An evidence-based written plan that describes program practices for supporting the learning of each child based on their individual developmental levels, learning styles, and interests and is informed by the RI Early Learning and Development Standards and/or Common Core State Standards/Grade Level Expectations for Kindergarten” (Early Learning and Development Standards, p. 65).

In Rhode Island early childhood curriculum is defined as having two levels: *program-level curriculum* and *classroom-level curriculum*. *Program-level curriculum* consists of an evidence-based written plan, or curriculum framework, that outlines the programs priorities for teaching and learning. *Program-level curriculum* (also referred to as a curriculum framework) describes the expectations of teachers as they develop classroom-level curriculum to support each child’s developmental level, learning style, and interests. *Program-level curriculum* is aligned with the Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards (RIELDS) and/or the Common Core State Standards/Grade Level Expectations for kindergarten. Teaching staff then use the curriculum framework to guide the development of classroom-level curriculum, which is a plan for support children’s learning and development across all the domains of learning. High-quality early learning programs use both *program-level* and

classroom-level curricula to ensure that all children will enter school prepared to be successful (EXCEED Tip Sheet: Curriculum; EXCEED Tip Sheet: Developing a Program-Level Curriculum Framework).

In Rhode Island, educational leaders in high-quality early learning programs design and implement a comprehensive curriculum framework that addresses the four components: **Content, Context, Process, and Teaching and Facilitating**. Teachers use their program's curriculum framework as their guide to designing and implementing a classroom-level curriculum that reflects these same four components. The four components of curriculum are defined below:

- **Content** refers to what children should know, understand and be able to do.
- **Context** outlines the design of the environment and materials needed to implement the curriculum. In Rhode Island it includes the environments, materials, schedules and routines, group size and learning formats.
- **Process** addresses the ways children learn and how those ways inform the delivery of the instruction. In Rhode Island it includes the theorists, temperaments, learning styles, and play
- **Teaching and Facilitating** focus on the teacher's role in implementing the curriculum. In Rhode Island it includes teacher roles, relationships, intentional teaching and quality interactions

Curricula reviewed for this report were evaluated not only based on the alignment to the actual Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards document (Content) but also according to the state's broader definition of curriculum based on these four components. Presented below is information which is essential in understanding the indicators of quality and in interpreting the curriculum ratings.

How to Use and Interpret These Findings

The Rhode Island Department of Education will not be making recommendations on curricula reviewed in this document; rather, the Department has compiled the average of the reviewer's scores from the curriculum review. These scores are intended to provide information on each of the specific domains evaluated within the curriculum review. The scale used for the review is as follows: 1 Not Evident, 2 Minimal, 3 Satisfactory and 4 Exceptional. Curricula more closely meeting the rigor of the Departments rubric would have more scores at the higher end of the scale, 4's, for examples, instead of 1's. A complete table of scores the reviewed curricula can be found in the Appendix A. Each of the indicators presented, and the associated scores have been shared so that curricula consumers can make informed decisions based on each distinct indicator.

Evaluation Criteria and Scores

Indicator: Alignment with the RI Early Learning and Development Standards and Definition of Curriculum

Content- The Standards represent expectations for young children's learning and continual growth in all areas: intellectual, physical, and emotional. They also outline a course for what children should know, understand and be able to do when entering kindergarten. The alignment documents demonstrate connections between Domains, Components and Learning Goals in breadth, depth and intent and represent the component of curriculum defined as content in Rhode Island. A comprehensive curriculum should include all domains of development and address the states early learning and development standards within each domain. In addition to covering each broad domain, a curriculum should also cover each of the subsections, or elements, that have been identified as important taught in an integrated way.

Context- Represents the environment, materials, schedules/routines and group sizes of classrooms. These are further defined below.

- Environment- The curriculum should provide guidance related to a learning environment that is well organized, accessible to all children and equipped with clearly defined learning areas.
- Materials- The curriculum should describe how the materials and equipment are intentionally chosen to support children's learning, interests. The materials should be rich in variety, reflect the lives of children and families, accommodate children with unique learning needs, reflect diversity, and support independent use and exploration.
- Schedules and Routines- The curriculum shall guide teachers in the implementation of a developmentally appropriate daily schedule that is predictable, yet flexible and responsive to the needs of the children. The schedule should reflect a mix of child and teacher initiated activities, time for extended learning opportunities, indoor and outdoor activities, opportunities for active and quiet activities.
- Group Size-The schedule should provide an opportunity for large group, small group and individual activities.

Process- Process represents theories, temperaments, learning styles and play. These are further defined below.

- Theorists- Theorists provide a basis for understanding child development. A curriculum should provide details around how the theorists in the philosophy are evidenced. For example Smilanski talks about how play is the process in which children learn and we use play as the primary activity for our children's curriculum.
- Temperaments- Temperament is helps caregivers better understand children's individual differences. By understanding and planning for the various temperamental styles in an educators classroom, caregivers can learn how to help children express their preferences, desires, and feelings appropriately.

- Learning Styles- The learning styles approach to education focuses on the fact that individuals perceive and process information in very different ways. Educators need to place emphasis on methods that address as many of the eight learning styles as possible. While it may be difficult to address every learning style in every activity, the utilization of differing styles will add both a dynamic aspect to the classroom while addressing the needs of differing learners.
- Play- Play should be mentioned as the primary vehicle through which children learn. Teachers shall implement curriculum through play experiences that provide multiple opportunities for all children to attain developmentally appropriate goals in each developmental domain. As a result, the curriculum should describe the ways in which children are given purposeful opportunities to engage with materials and peers in the different stages of play so that they have play opportunities to learn at different levels.

Teaching and Facilitating- Teaching and Facilitating represents teachers roles, relationships and intentional teaching. These are further defined below.

- Teacher Roles- Teachers utilize a range of teacher behaviors including scaffolding, modeling and direct teaching.
- Relationships- Teachers recognize how responsive caregiving builds solid relationships that support children’s development at all levels.
- Intentional Teaching- Intentional teaching starts with the standards and includes all areas of learning help children of all ages to learn the skills we want them know understand and be able to do. A curriculum should articulate intentional teaching practices that are planned, thoughtful, and purposeful. Intentional teaching is “planned, thoughtful, and

purposeful” and requires teachers to “use their knowledge, judgment, and expertise to organize learning experiences for children” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 23).

The scores for this indicator can be found below. While a curriculum may have demonstrated an alignment to the Domains, Components and Learning Goals of the RIELDS it might not have met one of the other four components.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Big Day for Pre-K	Voyager We Can Early Learning
Aligned with the Early Learning and Development Standards and Definition of Curriculum	4	4	3	3	3	3	2.5	2.5	1.5	2	1.5	1.25

Indicator: Evidence Based Using Sound Research Methodology with Demonstrated Child Outcomes

Widespread agreement exists that curriculum should be based on evidence and evaluated for its effectiveness (National Research Council, 2001). A research-based curriculum is built upon and includes components that have been shown to be effective and supported by previous research. It’s especially important that a curriculum be research-validated, which means that studies have been conducted with the curriculum, evaluating its effectiveness in the classroom. In the current educational climate, educators must already be, or learn how to become,

wise consumers of research. Without determining the true effectiveness of a curriculum, programs may waste time and money using a curriculum that does not work with their student population. Some publishers claim that a curriculum is research-based, but these “claims of a research base are insufficient for establishing that [a curriculum] will be effective [within a given program]. How the research was conducted is a critical element in deciding whether such claims can be trusted” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 5).

Not all curricula have been studied, or are even based on a systematic and comprehensive review of research of how children learn. Studies on particular curricula should be conducted evaluating outcomes for the specific children the curriculum has been designed for (Frede & Ackerman, 2007). A program can select a specific “research based curriculum” for use with its enrolled children— confident that it is the right choice, when in reality the curriculum was shown to be effective with children who are older or younger, or who differ in culture or language, from the children for whom the curriculum is now being adopted. Other programs or school districts may adopt a curriculum for one specific area, such as reading or mathematics, with little regard for how that curriculum aligns with, or is consistent with other aspects of the program. The National Research Council (2001) warns that such a piecemeal approach can result in disconnected activities and teaching methods, lacking focus, coherence, or comprehensiveness. Thus programs should be careful that when selecting a curriculum that is research based by ensuring that the group of children does not differ from those in which the curriculum has been shown to be effective.

Important factors for evaluating the evidence base of a particular curriculum are further outlined below.

- *Authorship*- Reviewers should take note of who conducted the research. The National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER) cautions against relying solely on research conducted by the developer or author, stating that “decision makers need

to be skeptical of curriculum developers claims unless they are confirmed by researchers who are unaffiliated with the curriculum model” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 12).

- *Publication Source*- It is important to consider where the research was published. The research being reviewed should be published in a peer-reviewed journal (e.g., Early Education and Development, Early Childhood Education Journal, Journal of Early Intervention, International Journal of Early Childhood, Journal of Research in Childhood Education, Child Development, etc.). The peer review process requires papers to be evaluated by other researchers/experts in the field. Although there is not a standardized set of criteria that all peer reviewers use, individual journals typically have stringent criteria for review of research methods and findings.
- *Study Sample and Setting*- When reviewing research, it is important to review the demographics and other characteristics of the study sample (children, teachers, schools, etc.). A curriculum that is effective for one group of children may not necessarily be effective for a group with different characteristics. For example, a curriculum may be effective for a group of children who are typically-developing, English-speaking, and from a middle-income background, but may not be as effective for group with special needs, ELLs or DLLs, and from a low income background (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 10). The following characteristics should be considered as they relate to those of the program: age, ethnicity and culture, linguistic background, socioeconomic status, and special needs of children in the class; class size; number of teachers and paraprofessionals in each classroom; and locale (e.g., rural, suburban, urban). If information is available, the educational background of the teachers, including the amount of training they had in the curriculum, should

also be considered and compared to that of the program. If the demographics of the study sample differ greatly from that of the program for which the curriculum is being considered, programs should use caution in assuming that the curriculum would have the same effects if implemented in their program.

- *Study Design and Rigor*- Various aspects of the study design should be a role in the evaluation of evidence related to a curriculum. There are many detailed and technical aspects of study designs and analyses that influence their quality. First, consider the different groups of participants are included in the study. Does the study only include one group of children, all of whom were exposed to the curriculum? Or does it include two or more groups (some who were exposed to the curriculum and some who weren't) and compare performance? When only one group of students is included in a study, researchers cannot determine whether student outcomes are the result of the curriculum. When multiple groups of students with differing degrees of exposure to the curriculum under review are included and compared, researchers are able to say that exposure to the curriculum was related to student outcomes. When multiple groups of children are compared in the study, reviewers should determine whether significant differences were found between these groups. This highlights two important questions: (1) Did children who were exposed to the curriculum show better outcomes or scores than children who were not? and (2) If there were statistically significant differences between groups, were these differences practically or educationally significant? It's important that when significant differences are found between groups of children, that reviewers evaluate the claims of the authors, and determine the meaning and importance of any differences found.

For purposes of the curriculum alignment review, reviewer’s asked publishers for research and evaluation findings and used the above criteria when evaluating the results. Reviewers used additional resources when available, such as What Works Clearinghouse (<http://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/>) in their scoring of this indicator. Scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Big Day for Pre-K	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Voyager We Can Early Learning
Evidence Based Using Sound Research Methodology with Demonstrated Child Outcomes	4	4	3.5	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	1.75	1.5

Indicator: *The Curriculum Includes Goals and Objectives for Children’s Learning and Development*

A review was done as to whether the curriculum includes specific, measurable and child-focused goals that the curriculum seeks to foster. The goals should be tied to a comprehensive set of learning activities for which there should be a clear scope and sequence aligned to the goals. A strong curriculum should attend to children’s overall development, yet, a single curriculum might not address all domains, or areas, of learning. This indicator scored whether the curriculum identified a specific set of goals and objectives for children’s development, the degree to which the curriculum incorporated an understanding of the whole child related to these goals and how developmentally appropriate the stated goals and objectives were. While curriculums may have had stated goals, they may have had a limited scope and view of development or have

articulated inappropriate goals based on what we know and understand about children’s development. The scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Voyager We Can Early Learning	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Big Day for Pre-K
Includes Goals and Objectives for Children’s Learning	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	2.5	2.5	2.5	1.5

Indicator: *The Curriculum is Clearly Designed for Children between Birth and 60 Months (Developmentally Appropriate)*

Not all published curriculums can be considered appropriate for young children. Developmentally appropriate practice (DAP), is an approach to teaching grounded in research on how young children develop and learn and in what is known about effective early education. DAP involves teachers meeting young children where they are (by their developmental stage), both as individuals and as part of a group; and helping each child meet challenging and achievable learning goals.

The three core considerations of DAP include:

- Knowledge of child development and learning. This knowledge, based on research, helps us decide which experiences are best for children’s learning and development.

- Knowledge of what is individually appropriate. What we learn about specific children helps us teach and care for each child as an individual. By continually observing children’s play and interaction with the physical environment and others, we learn about each child’s interests, abilities, and developmental progress.
- Knowledge of what is culturally important. We must make an effort to get to know the children’s families and learn about the values, expectations, and factors that shape their lives at home and in their communities. This background information helps us provide meaningful, relevant, and respectful learning experiences for each child and family (Bredekamp & Copple, 1997).

Reviewers looked at all components of curriculum relative to age of children it was designed for in order to assess whether developmentally appropriate practice is utilized in the areas of content, context, process, and teaching and facilitating. The scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Big Day for Pre-K	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Voyager We Can Early Learning
Clearly Be Designed for Children Between Birth and 60 Months (DAP)	4	4	3.5	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	1.75	1.5

Indicator: *The Curriculum Articulates a Theoretical Base for its Approach*

The National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER) identifies potential philosophical approaches of a curriculum. The curriculum should articulate the theories of knowledge that underpin the developers understanding of how children develop and learn. For example, does the curriculum take a constructivist approach pulling from Piaget or Vygotsky or more of a Maturationist approach (Frede & Ackerman, 2007).

The selected curriculum must align with a program’s overall philosophy, mission, and goals related to children’s early learning and development (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). Teachers are more likely to implement a curriculum if it aligns with their teaching philosophy (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). For example, does the program believe in a more direct instruction approach, a socialization approach, a constructivist approach, or something in between? The scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculu m for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Big Day for Pre-K	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Voyager We Can Early Learning
Demonstrate a Strong Theoretical Base for Its Approach	4	4	4	4	4	4	2.5	2.5	2	2	1.5	1.25

Indicator: *Demonstrates a Balance of Opportunities for Teacher and Child Directed Instruction*

Informed by the curricula theoretical frame, a curriculum articulates approaches to teaching and learning across a continuum of teacher and child directed opportunities. A report from the National Research Council titled Eager to Learn (2001) states “children need opportunities to initiate activities and follow their interests, but teachers are not passive during these [child]-initiated and directed activities. Similarly, children should be actively engaged and responsive during teacher-initiated and –directed activities. Good teachers help support the child’s learning in both types of activities” (National Research Council, 2001, 8). Teachers must know when to use a given strategy to accommodate the different ways that individual children learn and the specific content they are learning” (Epstein, 2007, 1).It is understood that within a given day children and teachers may utilize a variety of different teaching strategies, however, it is a generally agreed upon practice that a curriculum have a substantial portion of the day for child directed activities. This indicator was scored based on schedules provided, as well as descriptions of the general sequence of activities and events children experience. The scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Voyager We Can Early Learning	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Big Day for Pre-K
Balance of Teacher and Child Directed Instruction	4	4	4	4	3.5	3	3	1.75	1.5	1.5	1.5	1

Indicator: Provides Clear Information for Educators on How the Curriculum May be Modified for Diverse Learners in Order to Facilitate Each Child's Progress Toward the Expressed Goals and Objectives

Reviewers looked at whether the curriculum provided guidance for differentiating teaching for children with special behavioral, learning or linguistic needs. Curricula were reviewed for their approaches to supporting English Language Learners, Dual Language Learners, and children with special needs. Curricula should include information for how the curriculum can be tailored for the unique needs of children using appropriate practices. The curriculum should speak to the individualization of instruction which helps to create inclusive classrooms by ensuring access and opportunities to participate by all children. A curriculum should allow for and provide guidance around making accommodations, such as: the adaptation of toys and other materials, methods and interactions such as grouping patterns, and the purposeful arrangement of environments (Frede & Ackerman, 2007).

A curriculum should also provide guidance for teachers on modifications. Modifications are defined as “substantial changes, practices, and expectations” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 4) based on children’s needs. Modification include things, such as changing learning goals for specific children or the content to be covered for specific children to meet their learning needs (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). The curriculum should not only allow for and provide guidance on how teachers can individualize instruction by making accommodations and modifications for children, but should also allow for multiple, more intensive intervention strategies or programs to be incorporated within the classroom setting.

When classrooms include children with and without special learning or behavioral needs an inclusive curriculum with a “universal design for learning” (UDL) should be implemented (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). A universally designed inclusive curriculum is one in which all aspects of the curriculum are “context sensitive” and create equal access for and invite active participation of all children,

including those with unique experiences and learning needs (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). There are three essential principles of UDL: (1) multiple means of representation, (2) multiple means of engagement, and (3) multiple means of expression, each of which require accommodations and modifications to support all learners.

- **Multiple Means of Representation:** First, a curriculum should allow for multiple means of representation, meaning that instruction, questions, expectations, and learning opportunities should be provided in different, multiple formats and at varying levels of complexity. They should also address a range of ability levels and visual, auditory, and kinesthetic needs (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013).
- **Multiple Means of Engagement:** A curriculum should also allow for and provide guidance on how teachers can create multiple means of engagement for children (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). This requires teachers to have information about using multiple means of scaffolding, or support, to help maintain children's engagement. Another way that a curriculum can help to maintain engagement of all children is to balance novelty (e.g., randomness and surprise) with familiarity (e.g., repetition and predictability) within learning opportunities. Posing developmentally appropriate learning challenges and providing children with varied ways to direct their play and be involved in such learning routines and planned activities can also support children's active engagement (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013).

- Multiple Means of Expression: There should also be guidance so that all children have the opportunity to demonstrate their knowledge and what they can do, regardless of their abilities. Children should be encouraged to express themselves in many different ways, including the use of both verbal and non-verbal expressions of ideas, feelings, and preferences. This may include allowing children to use speech, signs or gestures, drawing/pictures, objects, writing, or assistive technology as a means of expression. Children should be encouraged to communicate with peers in such ways as well (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). A curriculum should also include learning activities that are arranged in such a way

	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Voyager We Can Early Learning	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Big Day for Pre-K	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition
Supports for Individual Children (ELL, DLL, Children with Special Needs)	4	3.5	3.5	3.5	3	3	2	2	2	2	1.5	1

that all children can be successful.

Given the increasing percentages of children classified as ELLs and DLLs, a curriculum should include linguistically-relevant tools and materials that teachers can utilize in learning opportunities to help build a solid base for later learning. Research also shows that when these children are supported in developing solid foundation in their home language while learning English they have higher levels of later academic achievement (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). This indicator was scored based on an overarching consideration for this domain- i.e. were there explicit opportunities for differentiation, were children with special needs and included in the materials which were selected, and were the differentiation opportunities appropriate and sensitive to the unique needs of children. The scores for this specific indicator can be found below.

Indicator: *Provides a Means for Appropriate Child Assessment Practices*

Child assessment is a complex and multifaceted critical component to consider when choosing a curriculum. The main purposes of assessment are: (1) to inform and support decision-making related to teaching and learning, and (2) to identify significant concerns that may require focused intervention for individual children. An assessment system associated with a curriculum should be comprehensive and include integrated methods for assessing all domains and domain elements identified in the Standards. The assessment system should also be directly linked to the learning goals of the curriculum to ensure that assessment results will provide useful information about whether the curriculum is achieving what it is intended. The content and methods of the assessment must be developmentally appropriate for the age group included in the program. It should also be culturally and linguistically reflective of the children's backgrounds, incorporating culturally based experiences when possible. For English Language Learners (ELLs) and Dual Language Learners (DLLs), materials and implementation methods should

incorporate the child's first language to ensure that assessment results reflect children's actual knowledge of the content being assessed, and not just their ability to understand and speak English (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013).

Guidance should be provided on multiple formal and informal methods to measure curriculum goals and objectives, as reflected in children's behaviors and learning. Such methods can include: observations of children's interactions and play, examinations of work samples or portfolios, asking children questions, using checklists and rating scales, or norm-referenced tests. Assessment administration methods should allow for the evaluation of what children can do independently, as well as what they can do with assistance from other children or adults. Additionally, the assessment should allow for multiple sources of evidence. For example, assessment data should come from teachers, other child care providers, families, community service providers, and other intervention specialists (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013).

The child assessment system should document changes over time and provide a means for engaging and informing families. Ongoing assessment should provide mechanisms to document changes in individual children's learning and growth over time (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). The curriculum should provide guidance about how to interpret and use the information collected from the assessment, including sharing information with families. Teachers and others who will use the assessment information need to understand how to observe, document, and analyze the results and how to summarize them as a whole. Once the data have been collected and summarized, teachers then need to know how to interpret these results to better understand and improve their teaching and students' learning. This can occur by learning how to adjust the curriculum, their teaching strategies, and/or the learning environment to guide future instruction and to guide the learning of individual children. Additionally, the methods in which assessments are administered should be aligned with how children

learn. Assessments should be authentic and engage children in meaningful tasks within a meaningful context. Simply put, “assessment evidence [should be] gathered from realistic settings and situations that reflect children’s actual performance” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 11).

Information should also be provided on strategies and procedures for accommodating and/or modifying the assessment to meet the needs of diverse learners. Teachers and other early childhood staff working with children “need a clear understanding of all children’s current skills and abilities to ensure access and participation, and to develop appropriate learning opportunities” (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013, 5). It is important that the assessment system associated with a given curriculum allows for the review of children’s learning and progress on a regular and ongoing basis, as opposed to only assessing children’s learning or progress at the beginning and/or end of the school or academic year (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013).

Score for this indicator were determined based on whether the curriculum had an associated child assessment system, whether the child assessment system was comprehensive, appropriate, and included multiple opportunities for collecting data. In some cases a curriculum may not have an associated child assessment system, other times it may have a corresponding system, but it is not appropriate and does not meet best practice guidelines. The scores for this indicator based on these considerations can be found below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Voyager We Can Early Learning	Big Day for Pre-K
Appropriate	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	2.75	2.75	2	1

Child Assessment												
-------------------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Indicator: Curriculum's Ease of Use

Because teachers are frontline implementers of curriculum, curricula were reviewed for how dependent they are on teachers experience levels and educational backgrounds. For example, if teachers do not have an educational background that provides a foundation in child development and early childhood pedagogy, it could be difficult to implement curricula that give teachers great latitude in choosing daily learning activities. Scripted curricula can override such difficulties by providing clear examples, directions and sequences that are to be used by all. However, for teachers with stronger teaching skills and professional experience they may prefer the opportunity for greater differentiation and utilization of their skills (Frede & Ackerman, 2007). This indicator was scored based on the ease of use for all educators- new and experienced. Some curricula, while extremely detailed on what teachers should do whereas others were much more open ended and allowed for guided creativity which would manifest differently based on the educators levels of experience. These considerations can be found reflected in the indicator below.

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Voyager We Can Early Learning	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Big Day for Pre-K
Ease of Use	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	2.5	2.25	2	1

Indicator: Curriculum's Affordability

A practical critical component of evaluating a curriculum is its affordability which in part, helps to determine the feasibility of the curriculum for a particular program or school. Cost considerations may include: the initial cost of purchasing the curriculum materials; the cost for sustaining the curriculum (e.g., replacing materials, annual renewals); the cost of initial and ongoing training to train teachers on how to use the curriculum, required coaching or technical etc. The feasibility of a curriculum is key, because it helps to determine whether it can be implemented within a program with fidelity and long term. Points to consider when reviewing affordability include:

- **Affordability:** Can the budget support the purchase and implementation of the curriculum, including costs related to: initial purchase, sustainability, training, and ongoing support? How many versions will have to be purchased for the program, for example, is it one book per classroom meaning multiple copies would need to be ordered. What is included in the purchase? Are there additional costs for added resources, in order to obtain the full curriculum? Are there per child, per year costs or are expenses one time up front? Are there ongoing monthly fees versus one up-front costs to purchase?
- **Feasibility:** Can the curriculum be implemented in the program? Are the following program factors appropriate: child teacher ratio; experience, skills, and education of staff; school day/week structure; and facility, space, and equipment requirements?

The information below provides information on the costs associated with purchasing and continuing implementation of the submitted curriculums. It can generally be assumed that costs are per classroom, as each classroom should have ready access to the curriculum resources.

Curricula	Cost
Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3 rd edition	<p>\$1,149.00 for the English and Spanish version, \$1,795.00 for the bilingual version. Includes: The Foundation, Daily Resources, Intentional Teaching Cards, Mighty Minutes, Highlights Hello, Book Conversation Cards, Learning Games, The Resource Organizer and The Guide to The Creative Curriculum for Infants, Toddlers & Twos. Does not include Teaching Strategies Gold Child Assessment System https://shop.teachingstrategies.com/page/76108-Creative-Curriculum-Infants-Toddlers-Twos.cfm</p>
Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	<p>\$2,149.00 for the English and Spanish version, \$2,999.00 for the bilingual version. Includes: The Foundation, Daily Resources- Intentional Teaching Cards, Six Teaching Guides, Intentional Teaching Cards, Mighty Minutes, The Teaching Strategies Children’s Book Collection, Book Discussion Cards, The Teaching Strategies Children’s eBook Collection (DVD), The Resource Organizer, The Getting Started DVD Does not include Teaching Strategies Gold Child Assessment System https://shop.teachingstrategies.com/page/73756-creative-curriculum-system-preschool.cfm</p>
Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care, 2 nd edition	<p>\$99.95 for the English or Spanish version. Includes: The Foundation, Routines & Experiences, Sixty-eight laminated Learning Games, Caring and Learning DVD/VHS, CD-ROM with copies of forms and letters to parents. Does not include Teaching Strategies Gold Child Assessment System https://shop.teachingstrategies.com/page/71035-creative-curriculum-family-child-care.cfm</p>
Big Day for Pre-K	<p>\$2,850 for the English edition and \$3,830 for the Spanish edition. English Kit Includes: Teacher Welcome Kit (Professional Handbook, Classroom Routines Poster, Audiobooks, BookStix, Technology Portfolio and Big Day Teacher Space, Family Space, and BookFlix), Big Theme Box 1-8, Wall Chart Box, Big and Little Book Boxes Spanish Kit Includes: Teacher Welcome Kit (Professional Handbook, Classroom Routines Poster, Audiobooks*, BookStix, Technology Portfolio and Big Day Teacher Space, Family Space, and BookFlix), Big Theme Box 1-8, Big Learning Box (Big Learning Box: Letter Vest and Vest Pocket Letters, Magnetic Board Set and Alphabet Letters, Letter Cards, Picture Cards, Math Mats, Number Cards, Science Posters, Songs and Fingerplays Book, Songs CDs, Manipulatives Kit, Clifford Books, Clifford Puppet and Clifford Poster), Wall Chart Box, Big and Little Book Boxes in English and Spanish http://teacher.scholastic.com/products/early-learning-program/BigDay-OrderNow-OrderForm-HMH.pdf</p>
HighScope Infants and Toddlers	<p>\$293.50 for the full set of resources Includes: Tender Care and Early Learning: Supporting Infants and Toddlers in Child Care Settings 2nd Ed., Infant-Toddler Programs, Key Developmental Indicators Desk-Size Posters, Infant-Toddler Key Developmental Indicators Wall Chart, Infant-Toddler Wheel of Learning/Key Developmental Indicators Card, Infant-Toddler Program Quality Assessment (PQA) Form A: Observation Items, Program Quality Assessment (PQA) Form B: Agency Items for Infant-Toddler and Preschool</p>

Curricula	Cost
	<p>Programs, Active Learning DVD - Infant Toddler, Daily Schedules and Caregiving Routines, Supportive Adult-Child Interactions, It's Mine! Responding to Problems and Conflicts DVD and HighScope Excellerations™ Soft Crocheted Balls - Set of 10.</p> <p>Optional: Infants Supplement (\$299.99), or Toddler Supplement (\$279.99)</p> <p>http://secure.highscope.org/productcart/pc/viewCategories.asp?idCategory=229</p>
HighScope for Preschoolers	<p>\$379.60 for the full Preschool set</p> <p>Includes: Essentials of Active Learning in Preschool: Getting to Know the HighScope Curriculum, 2nd ed., Lesson Plans for the First 30 Days: Getting Started With HighScope, 2nd Ed., The HighScope Preschool Curriculum Set, Key Developmental Indicator (KDI) Scaffolding Charts, The HighScope Preschool Curriculum.</p> <p>http://secure.highscope.org/productcart/pc/viewCategories.asp?idCategory=230</p>
Tools of Mind, 6th edition	<p>Tools of the Mind cannot be purchased independently without having attended the required professional development. The first year costs are \$3,000 per classroom, including training but excluding travel. The curriculum guide is an additional \$100. The second year of the curriculum and associated supports are \$1,500.</p> <p>http://www.toolsofthemind.org/about/fags/</p>
<p>Mother Goose Time for Preschoolers</p> <p>*Little Goose Time</p>	<p>Costs vary depending on the number of children in the classroom. For a class of 20, the costs are \$146.49 per month plus \$18.99 shipping.</p> <p>Optional Materials: Little Goose teacher Guide \$18 month, More math and Literacy \$6.99, Experience Gold Teacher Pack \$14.99, Child pack \$5 per child, Toy Box \$134 per month</p> <p>https://secure.mothersgoosetime.com/pdf/MGT_Pricing.pdf</p>
Open the World of Learning (OWL)	<p>Complete Pre-K Kit \$1,477.47</p> <p>Includes: 6 Teacher's Guides (one for each of six units), Program Guide, 48 Children's Books, 100 full-color Picture Cards, Sing-Along Songs and Poems CD, Evaluating Language and Literacy in Four-Year-Olds: A Practical Guide for Teachers, Math Activity Aids, Professional Development DVD</p> <p>http://www.pearsonschool.com/index.cfm?locator=PSZpNy&PMDBSOLUTIONID=6724&PMDBSITEID=2781&PMDBCATEGORYID=3289&PMDBSUBSOLUTIONID=&PMDBSUBJECTAREAID=&PMDBSUBCATEGORYID=&PMDbProgramId=22125&elementType=programComponents</p>
Curiosity Corner-2	<p>\$3,495 for materials (plus 10% shipping) per classroom plus a \$700 technology fee</p> <p>Includes: theme guides for each two-week unit, theme-related children's books, manipulatives, games, video content on flash drives to use during circle time, other materials to support the theme-related activities</p> <p>http://www.successforall.org/Early-Childhood/Powerful-Instruction/Curiosity-Corner/</p>
We Can Early Learning Curriculum	<p>\$2695.00 per classroom for the first year, then \$149.95 per classroom each renewal year. Costs are for one classroom which is considered 20 children.</p> <p>Includes: Teacher Editions Volumes 1–6, Teacher Resource Guide, Assessment Guide, Letter, Word, and Picture Cards,</p>

Curricula	Cost
	12 flip books, Digital assets, The I Can Draw Pre-Writing Kit, 34-book literature set, Classroom management kit, Several manipulative items that bring instruction to life http://store.voyagersopris.com/wecan/

* Little Goose Time is not a comprehensive infant and toddler curriculum, but rather an add-on resource to the primary preschool curriculum.

Indicator: Professional Development Requirements and Supports

There are a variety of professional development opportunities that may be available from the curriculum publisher or some other organization associated with the publisher. Whereas some curriculums may be purchased without additional or required professional development options, others require professional development prior to implementation. Opportunities for professional development vary widely from initial onsite training for teachers, follow up visits, refresher courses, and online training opportunities such as webinars in addition to ongoing support in the form of coaching or technical assistance. Overall, there is a large continuum of possible professional services in which programs may participate and should consider—from larger training sessions, to more job-embedded opportunities that are closer to the work of the classroom (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). Ideally, training opportunities would be available for all early childhood staff working with children in any capacity (e.g., teachers, assistant teachers, education coordinators, directors, etc.). Additionally, there should be professional development for specialized groups such as special educators working within the classroom.

There are other factors related to professional learning that should also be reviewed, which will likely require going beyond the information provided on curriculum websites and in related materials. First, it's important to find out whether trainers are required to have a background in the methods or curriculum being reviewed, as this can greatly influence the quality of the training (North Dakota Department of

Public Instruction, 2013). NIEER points out that, “to be effective, such training should be provided by individuals who are familiar not only with adult learning principles, but also with the realities of teachers’ classrooms” (Frede & Ackerman, 2007, 11). Other factors pertain to whether professional development aligns philosophically with other professional development program staff are participating in. When introducing a new curriculum into a program, it is imperative that all teachers have access to a variety of professional learning opportunities, regardless of their educational background (North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 2013). The information below provides additional details as to the professional development requirements and opportunities for each curriculum submitted.

Curricula	Professional Development
Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3 rd edition	<p>A variety of in-person sessions are available, and vary from 1-2 days. Professional development is available in both English and Spanish. Topics include: implementing the curriculum, partnering with families, and fidelity of implementation among other topics. Call for additional cost related information. http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/in-person-creative-curriculum/</p> <p>Online modules are also available, which provide an overview of the curriculum and child assessment system. Online training is available at no cost when purchasing the curriculum. http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/online/</p>
Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	<p>A variety of in-person sessions are available, and vary from 1-2 days. Professional development is available in both English and Spanish. Topics include: implementing the curriculum, partnering with families, and fidelity of implementation among other topics. Call for additional cost related information. http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/in-person-creative-curriculum/</p> <p>Online modules are also available, which provide an overview of the curriculum and child assessment system. Online training is available at no cost when purchasing the curriculum. http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/online/</p>
Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care, 2 nd edition	<p>A variety of in-person sessions are available, and vary from 1-2 days. Professional development is available in both English and Spanish. Topics include: implementing the curriculum, partnering with families, and fidelity of implementation among other topics. Call for additional cost related information. http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/in-person-creative-curriculum/</p> <p>Online modules are also available, which provide an overview of the curriculum and child assessment system. Online training is available at no cost when purchasing the curriculum.</p>

Curricula	Professional Development
	<p>http://teachingstrategies.com/professional-development/online/</p>
Big Day for Pre-K	<p>Scholastic provides free webinars on phonological awareness, read-aloud' s and developmentally appropriate questioning. Sessions include: Read Aloud: Definitely Allowed, Gearing Up, and Talk Matters: Meaningful Conversations in the Classroom.</p> <p>http://teacher.scholastic.com/products/early-learning-program/webinar/</p> <p>There are also online professional development courses on oral language, and emergent literacy and math skills.</p> <p>Face to face implementation support is also available. A half day implementation training is \$2,299, a full day implementation training is \$2,899, and a public group regional training is \$299 per teacher.</p> <p>http://teacher.scholastic.com/products/early-learning-program/big-day-for-prekindergarten-professional-development.htm</p>
HighScope Infant, Toddler and Preschool	<p>HighScope offers three options for professional development: Workshops/Courses, Customized Training and Conferences and Events. Face to face experiences can be in the format one or two day workshops, week long courses, or multi-week courses. Face to face sessions range in cost from \$120 to \$600 per session.</p> <p>Online training options which have specific start dates and associated course assignments are also offered. Webinars are also available as part of purchasing the curriculum.</p> <p>http://www.highscope.org/Content.asp?ContentId=709</p>
Tools of Mind, 6th edition	<p>The Tools professional development model includes engaging classroom teaching staff, leaders and associated specialists in ongoing coaching support. In the first year, teachers receive a subscription to the iPad app iScaffold, a multimedia tool to support implementation. There is also a series of webinars which emphasize classroom management, self-regulation development, and literacy, math and science content areas. In the second year, workshops and webinars are designed to help teachers become more intentional in their decision-making in the classroom. They emphasize individualization, assessment of child learning and fine-tuning accommodation for children with special needs, as well as learning how to embed practice in self-regulated learning into all activities and classroom practices. Lastly, there are also opportunities to participate in Regional Training Conferences which are held across the country.</p> <p>http://www.toolsofthemind.org/about/faqs/</p>

Curricula	Professional Development
Mother Goose Time for Preschoolers **Little Goose Time	<p>There are three options for professional development. These include: basic training webinars, onsite training and published training resources. The basic training webinars are a series of three sessions on Lesson Planning and Setting Up the Environment, Observation and Assessment, and Individualizing the Curriculum. The training resources include the Research Foundation, as well as Training Handbook which outlines goals related to the following: Planning Quality Experiences, Environment, Relationships, Child Assessment, and Child Progress Monitoring.</p> <p>The curriculum comes with a set of Basic Training materials. These three modules provide an overview on the curriculum, assessment and individualization.</p> <p>http://www.moothergoosetime.com/professional-development/</p>
Open the World of Learning (OWL)	<p>Offer several optional offerings including Product Activation/Implementation Essentials, Job Embedded Services and Workshops. The Product Activation/Implementation Essentials trainings are optional one or two day sessions. The Job Embedded Services include optional Coaching and Modeling, Small Group Lesson Studies and Consultative Services. The Workshops include Miscellaneous half day and full day trainings on specific areas of learning.</p> <p>http://www.pearsonschool.com/index.cfm?locator=PSZv5y&PMDbSiteId=2781&PMDbSolutionId=6724&PMDbSubSolutionId=&PMDbCategoryId=34201&PMDbSubCategoryId=34301&PMDbSubjectAreaId=&PMDbProgramId=144041</p>
Curiosity Corner-2	<p>Professional development coaching is available. The first year includes two days of initial training for teachers and teacher assistants. Coaching, Ongoing Support, and Teacher to Teacher Support Tools are available. Training is by request and are designed to meet the particular needs of the school/program. In addition, there is a fall conference which is open to those implementing the curriculum.</p> <p>http://www.successforall.org/Early-Childhood/Professional-Development/</p>
We Can Early Learning Curriculum	<p>Training is available both in-person and online. Webinars, phone consultation, and strategic planning sessions are complementary. Training packages can be purchased in half day, 1-2 day, 3-9, 10-24, and 25 plus day packages.</p> <p>http://www.voyagersopris.com/curriculum/subject/literacy/we-can-early-learning-curriculum/training-support</p>

** Little Goose Time was reviewed; however, it was decided not to independently score this resource. Little Goose Time is not a comprehensive infant and toddler curriculum, but rather an add-on resource to the primary preschool curriculum. As a result, the Little Goose Time materials do not meet the review team's definition of a curriculum.

Conclusion

Curriculum is a complex idea containing multiple components, such as goals, content, pedagogy, and instructional practices. It is much more than a series of activities or lesson plans. It is influenced by many factors, including society's values, accountability systems, research findings, community expectations, culture and language, and individual children's characteristics. A good, well-implemented early childhood curriculum provides developmentally appropriate support and challenges and, therefore, is likely to lead to positive outcomes (Frede, 1998). As a result, RIDE hopes that the results of the curriculum review will provide information which will assist educators in the development and/or selection of curriculum resources. This review has hopefully highlighted the complexity of factors which should be considered when making curricula decisions and in making consumer choices. Additionally, this list of by no means exhaustive, thus RIDE anticipates inviting additional submissions on an annual basis. Future submissions will inform annual updates to this report.

Appendix A

	High Scope Preschool	High Scope Infant and Toddler	Creative Curriculum for Preschoolers	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 3rd edition	Creative Curriculum for Infants and Toddlers, 2nd edition	Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care	Tools of Mind, 6th edition	Open the World of Learning (OWL)	Mother Goose Time for Preschool *Little Goose Time	Big Day for Pre-K	Curiosity Corner, 2nd edition	Voyager We Can Early Learning
Aligned with the Early Learning and Development Standards	4	4	3	3	3	3	2.5	2.5	1.5	1.5	2	1.25
Evidence Based Using Sound Research Methodology with Demonstrated Child Outcomes	4	4	3.5	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	1.75	1.5
Includes Goals and Objectives for Children's Learning	4	4	4	4	4	3	2.5	3	3	1.5	2.5	2.5
Clearly Be Designed for Children Between Birth and 60 Months (DAP)	4	4	4	4	4	4	2.5	2.5	2	2	1.5	1.25
Balance of Teacher and	4	4	4	3.5	3	4	3	1.5	1.75	1	1.5	1.5

Child Directed Instruction												
Supports for Individual Children (ELL, DLL, Children with Special Needs)	3.5	3.5	3	3.5	3	2	4	2	2	1.5	1	2
Appropriate Child Assessment	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	2.75	2.75	1	3	2
Ease of Use	4	4	4	4	3	4	2	3	2.5	1	3	2.25

Appendix B

Program Examples

The following presents several examples of how programs have used these results to inform decisions about selecting purchasable curricula which fits with their program.

Program A: Program A is located in an urban core, with a high percentage of children who are Dual Language Learners. Up until recently they have been using a self-developed curriculum, that valued child directed learning. Upon evaluation and reflection of their program goals, data collection, and information obtained in this report, they made a change to now use the High Scope Curriculum. They selected High Scope based on the fact that it scored high in the indicator for *Supports for Individual Children*, which the program felt was a particularly good match for their population.

Program B: Program B is a family Child Care Home which had been using a pre-purchased curriculum which was reflected as scoring low in the table for the indicator “Aligned with the Early Learning and Development Standards”. Due to the requirements of the state’s Quality Rating and Improvement System, Bright Stars, requiring a curriculum which was aligned to the Rhode Island Early Learning and Development Standards, the provider chose instead to make a change to the Creative Curriculum for Family Child Care which scored higher according to these findings.

Program C: Upon reviewing the results of the review, Program C reflected in the fact that the curriculum they have been using scored low in the indicator *Balance of Teacher and Child Directed Instruction*. Supporting more appropriate instructional strategies is something the program leadership identified as being a goal in the Programs Quality Improvement Plan. As a result, they utilized grant

finds to be able to purchase another curriculum which scored higher in this indicator and more closely aligned with their program quality improvement goals.

Appendix C

Resources

Below is a list of additional resources available to help programs choose and implement early learning curricula.

Center for Early Learning Professionals, Tip Sheets

<http://center-elp.org/resources/forms/tip-sheets/>

Comprehensive Early Childhood Program Approval (CECE)

<http://www.ride.ri.gov/InstructionAssessment/EarlyChildhoodEducation/Programs.aspx#13021-cece-program-approval>

Bright Stars Child Care Center and Preschool Framework

<http://www.brightstars.org/educators/child-care-center-and-preschool-quality-framework>

Bright Stars Family Child Care Homes Framework

<http://www.brightstars.org/educators/application-materials-for-family-child-care-homes>

References

- Bredenkamp, S. & Copple, C. (2009). *Developmentally Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood Programs Serving Children Birth through Age 8*. NAEYC, Washington, DC.
- Epstein, A. (2007). *The Intentional Teacher – Choosing the Best Strategies for Young Children’s Learning*. NAEYC, Washington, DC.
- Grisham-Brown, J., Hemmeter, M.L., & Pretti-Frontczak, K. (2005). *Blended Practices for Teaching Young Children in Inclusive Settings*. Paul Brookes Pub., Baltimore, MD.
- Gronlund, G. (2006). *Making Early Learning Standards Come Alive – Connecting Your Practice & Curriculum to State Guidelines*. Redleaf Press, St. Paul, MN.
- Frede, E. & Ackerman, D. (2007). *Preschool Curriculum Decision-Making: Dimensions to Consider*. National Institute for Early Education Research. Issue 12.
- National Association for the Education of Young Children (2003) and National Research Council (2001). *Early Childhood Curriculum, Assessment, and Program Evaluation: Building an Effective, Accountable System in Programs for Children Birth through Age 8*. Retrieved from <https://www.naeyc.org/files/naeyc/file/positions/CAPEexpand.pdf>
- National Association for the Education of Young Children (2009). *Developmentally Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood Programs Serving Children from Birth through Age 8*. Retrieved from <http://www.naeyc.org/DAP>
- National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning (n.d.). *Preschool Curriculum Consumer Report*.
- North Dakota Department of Public Instruction (2013). *Selecting a Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum: A Decision-Making Guide for Early Learning Educators*. Retrieved from <http://www.dpi.state.nd.us/EarlyChildhoodEduc/curricguidance.pdf>

National Research Council. (2000). Eager to learn: Educating our preschoolers. Washington, DC: National Academy Press.