



Enclosure 2a
February 22, 2017

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING
November 16, 2016**

RHODE ISLAND BOARD OF EDUCATION

The Rhode Island Board of Education met on Wednesday, November 16, 2016, at the Community College of Rhode Island, Warwick.

Attendance was as follows:

Colby Anderson: **absent** (ex-officio, non-voting member)
Amy Beretta: **absent**
Michael Bernstein: present
Colleen Callahan: present
Barbara Cottam: present
Heather Crosby: present (arrived at 6:12 p.m.)
Timothy DelGiudice: present (arrived at 5:41 p.m.)
Dennis Duffy: present
Karin Forbes: present (arrived at 5:40 p.m.)
William Foulkes: present
Jo Eva Gaines: present (left at 6:50 p.m.)
Rachelle Green: present
Mike Grey: present (ex-officio, non-voting member)
Thomas Izzo: present
Marta Martinez: **absent**
Daniel McConaghy: present
Stephan Pryor: **absent** (ex-officio, non-voting member)
Lawrence Purtill: **absent**
John Rainone: present (ex-officio, non-voting member)
Joyce Stevos: present (arrived at 5:42 p.m.)
Jeffery Williams: present

Chair Barbara Cottam welcomed everyone to the quarterly meeting of the R.I. Board of Education. She thanked President Hughes and the CCRI staff for hosting the meeting, declared a quorum present, and called the meeting to order at 5:40 p.m. She stated for the record that Board Members Beretta, Martinez and Purtill, had notified her that they would not be attending the meeting and that Provost DeHayes would represent President Dooley, who had another commitment this evening.

1. ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA

On a motion duly made by Colleen Callahan and seconded by Jo Eva Gaines it was

VOTED: That, the Rhode Island Board of Education accepts the agenda for the meeting of August 17, 2016.

Vote: 10 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Joe Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

[Members Crosby, DelGiudice, Forbes, and Stevos did not arrive until after the agenda was approved]

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

2a. Minutes of the August 17, 2016, Meeting

On a motion duly made by Jo Eva Gaines and seconded by Colleen Callahan, it was

VOTED: That the Rhode Island Board of Education approves the minutes of the August 17, 2016, meeting

Vote: 6 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, and Daniel McConaghy

NAYS: 0

[Members DelGiudice, Duffy, Forbes, Izzo, Purtill, and Williams had to recuse themselves from the vote as they did not attend the August 17, 2016, meeting of the Board of Education]

[Members Crosby, DelGiudice, Forbes, and Stevos did not arrive until after the minutes were approved]

3. OPEN FORUM

Two students representing Rhode Island College and one student representing the University of Rhode Island expressed concerns with the proposed tuition increases at Rhode Island Public Institutions of Postsecondary Education.

Two individuals representing the R.I. Foreign Language Association spoke in support of the Foreign Language Education Leadership position that has been proposed in RIDE's 2018-budget request.

Two members from the Providence City Council presented the Board with a resolution recently passed by the Providence City Council, as well as, a fiscal impact analysis prepared by the Internal Auditor of the City of Providence. They spoke in opposition to the Achievement First application for expansion, as well as, the two proposals for new charter schools (Wangari and Charette), which are before the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education.

4. REPORT OF THE CHAIRS

Chair of the Board of Education

Chair Cottam began her report by highlighting her recent visit to Washington D.C. She traveled with Governor Raimondo, Commissioner Wagner and others to give a presentation to the Chief of State School Officers on Rhode Island's plan for changing Career and Technical Education in the state.

Chair Cottam also highlighted that Rhode Island has increased their focus on raising awareness and participation on the STEM fields at the middle school level. Recently the Tech Collective, an industry association representing technology businesses in R.I. reported that 125 middle-school students and 10 educators attended the Collective's sixth annual STEM in the Middle Girls' Career Expo held at Rhode Island College. Students and teachers attended from Sophia Academy, Woonsocket Middle School, Paul Cuffee Middle School, and Calcutt Middle School in Central Falls. The expo was funded through a Real Jobs Rhode Island grant and sponsored by IBM and Dassault Systems Simulia, which aims to raise awareness and participation in the STEM fields at the middle-school level.

Chair of the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education

Chair McConaghy reported that over the last couple of months the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education has been working on revising three major sets of regulations (Regulations Governing the Certification of Educators in Rhode Island; Regulations Governing the Education of English Language Learners, and the Secondary School Regulations), all of which will have some bearing in the work of the Board of Education.

The Secondary School Regulations recently approved, include major revisions to the Rhode Island Diploma System, which will give students more ownership over their high-school diploma and will eliminate the use of standardized assessments as a statewide graduation requirement. Students will be able to earn a Commissioner's Seal by demonstrating their proficiency in literacy and mathematics on statewide assessments or on other assessments, such as the SAT. At a future date, the Council will approve the list of allowable assessments and the performance level students must attain to earn a Commissioner's Seal. The new graduation requirements will go into effect for the Class of 2021 (current 8th-graders).

Chair of the Council on Postsecondary Education

Chair Foulkes began by thanking the three students who came out to testify on the tuition increase. He expressed that both he and the Council on Postsecondary Education understand their position quite well and higher education has made tremendous efforts over the last year to be more effective, efficient and more innovative.

Chair Foulkes went on to share that he recently attended a conference of the Complete College America organization, an alliance of 40 states, whose purpose is to come up with strategies for getting students through college faster, and to dramatically improve graduation rates. He also attended another conference hosted by the University of Rhode Island on recognizing prior learning credits and getting adult learners back to school to earn their degrees as quickly as possible.

Chair Foulkes ended his report by congratulating the University of Rhode Island on the passage of question 4 on the bond and the Community College of Rhode Island on the new Cyber Lab at the Newport Campus. He also recognized John Rainone, the postsecondary education student representative on the Council for Postsecondary Education, whose two-year term on the Council ends this month.

5. REPORT OF THE COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner of Elementary and Secondary Education

Commissioner Wagner began his report by elaborating on the New Skills for Youth state presentation in Washington, D.C. that Chair Cottam reported on. He shared that Governor Raimondo was the only Governor to join her team for the presentation and that the judges noticed that as a sign of Rhode Island's commitment to the work. He proceeded to say that he spends a lot of time talking to people across the state about the need to transition from just talking about standards and test scores as proxy measures of learning and instead talk about rich and challenging learning opportunities for ALL kids. He expressed that we can't keep doing things the same way and expect different results. Innovation and how we do the business of schooling and how we design instructional experiences as part of our equity strategy, needs to be viewed differently. The New Skills for Youth grant will give Rhode Island the necessary resources to continue to challenge students and provide them with hands-on experiential learning opportunities that are aligned to 21st Century employability skills.

Next, Commissioner Wagner reported that RIDE has been working on the new federal law accountability plan, which is due on July 1, 2017. RIDE has been meeting monthly with a Committee of Practitioners and has scheduled five community meetings to gage the public's perspective on the initial thoughts and recommendations of Rhode Island's draft plan. Early conversations indicate that Rhode Island will stay on course with its academic standards on high school assessments. RIDE's emerging recommendation to the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education will be to employ a hybrid approach and have the PARCC test administered to all students in grade 9 and move toward the SAT as a statewide assessment in grade 11 that will be paid by the State.

Commissioner Wagner also reported on the comprehensive updates to the charter school law and the new process laid out by the General Assembly. The new process calls for a charter application with a 60-day public comment period related to the charter application. At the conclusion of the public comment period, it is the charge of the Commissioner to make a recommendation to the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education for the various proposals submitted to RIDE. When considering the Commissioner's recommendations, the Council has an obligation to consider substantially any fiscal, educational, or programmatic impacts. To assist the Council with making that consideration, the Commissioner will include in his recommendation an analysis from RIDE on the fiscal, educational, and programmatic impact, as well as an analysis from the public feedback.

Commissioner Wagner closed his remarks by stating that 19,000 students statewide are sitting in schools identified as a struggling school in need of intensive support through federal and state processes. Fifteen-thousand (61%) of those students are enrolled in Providence schools and in order to address that challenge, there needs to be a rich portfolio of options to address the issue. That portfolio has to include dual and concurrent enrollment opportunities for students, access to advanced-placement coursework, access to high-quality career and technical education programs, and access to universal PSAT and SAT coursework. In that portfolio of options, families may choose to enroll their children not only in public schools but also in private and public charter schools.

Commissioner of Postsecondary Education

Commissioner Purcell began his report by thanking the public institutions of postsecondary education for their hard work on developing performance measures for improving graduation persistence, increasing the number of graduates in high-demand and high-wage fields, and identifying targets for improvement as required by legislation passed at the end of the last legislative session.

Commissioner Purcell ended his report by sharing that he recently co-wrote an article for the New England Journal of Higher Education titled *Life after College: Retirement Security for Higher Ed Employees*, and that if anyone was interested, he would send them a link.

6. DISCUSSION ITEMS

a. Teacher Preparation Programs - Review Process

Commissioner Wagner introduced the topic by explaining that RIDE is currently in the midst of a very important process to review the teacher preparation programs at Rhode Island College and will be reviewing the University of Rhode Island's this spring. He explained that the preparation of teachers and school leaders is extremely important to the overall improvement of our school system and that Rhode Island has over 15 years of experience of providing standards-aligned approval processes for teacher-leader preparation programs. New standards related to teacher-leader preparation programs were adopted in 2013, and a new process for approval was piloted in 2014.

Commissioner Wagner turned the conversation over to Lisa Foehr, RIDE's Director of Educator Excellence and Certification Services, who provided a broad overview of the performance review process and the context for interpreting the report of findings.

Director Foehr reported that there are currently 10 approved providers in Rhode Island that offer programs in 49 certificate areas and approximately 650 completers from in-state programs each year. She explained that RIDE has been reviewing and approving teacher and leader programs for over 15 years, and in 2013, RIDE paused to revise the standards

with input from all stakeholders, including school level administrators and teachers. In 2014, the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education approved a new set of standards for educator preparation programs:

- Standard One – Professional Knowledge
- Standard Two – Clinical Partnerships and Practice
- Standard Three – Candidate Quality, Recruitment, and Assessment
- Standard Four – Program Impact
- Standard Five – Program Quality and Improvement

In closing, Commissioner Wagner expressed that the Feds recently published Teacher Preparation Regulations on how this information needs to work and what it needs to incorporate, but with the upcoming change in administration, he anticipates having to tweak Rhode Island's standards.

b. Concurrent Enrollment Course Lists

Commissioner Purcell gave an overview of the proposed concurrent enrollment course list for 2017-2018. He explained that annually the three public institutions for postsecondary education compile the list of college-level courses available to high-school students. The list was reviewed by the Office of the Postsecondary Commissioner in consultation with the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education to ensure that each course met the following criteria:

- Transferability of the course among the public institutions of higher education (as applicable) either as an equivalent course or as meeting a general education requirement;
- Applicability of the course to degree or certificate requirements;
- Applicability of the course to a technical degree or industry approved certification;
- Courses are in the college catalog and are regularly offered to students attending the college or university; and
- The academic catalog description communicates that the course is a rigorous college-level course.

Commissioner Purcell went over the list of the concurrent enrollment courses that will be offered by each of the three public institutions of postsecondary education and stated that last academic year, 92% of R.I. high schools took advantage of the opportunity.

c. PK-12 Capital Budget

Mark Dunham, Director of RIDE's Office of Finance, went over the PK-12 Capital Budget, a five-year budget request for \$53M to fund 10 projects. The request includes \$33M that was spent through June 30, 2016, leaving \$20M in spending from Fiscal Year 2017 through Fiscal Year 2022. All projects have been previously approved by the Board of Education, with the exception of the acceleration of a project at the MET School.

d. PK-12 Fiscal Year 2017 Revised and Fiscal Year 2018 Current Service Level Budgets**Fiscal Year 2017 Revised Budget**

Director Dunham explained that the Fiscal Year 2017 Revised Budget submission contains an overall \$58,000 increase in general revenue when compared with the Fiscal year 2016 Enacted Budget. He explained that the increase was due to several minor adjustments - \$13,000 to update the RIDE website to meet federal standards for accessibility, and \$50,000 for unanticipated attorney fees. The other increases are in the Federal Funds Budget (\$1.3M) and the Restricted Receipt Budget (\$143,000), which were anticipated and do not affect state dollars (general fund).

Fiscal Year 2018 Current Service Level Budget

Director Dunham went over the budget submission request of \$1,403,429,784, including a \$1,166,742,359 in General Revenue expenditures and a \$53.4M increase from the Fiscal Year 2017 Enacted Budget. The largest increase is \$48.6M in state-aid, distributed to local school districts and the second-largest increase is \$1.6M in teacher retirement. The budget request also includes around \$2M to fund new initiatives, some of which will be used to leverage talent and capacity at the district level to help execute the work.

e. Postsecondary Unrestricted and Restricted Budget Requests, Tuition and Fee Rates, and Tables of Organization for Fiscal Year 2018 - Fiscal Year 2019, and the Unrestricted and Restricted Budget Allocations for Fiscal Year 2017

Commissioner Purcell gave a national overview of the educational appropriations and total education revenue per FTE, noting that in 2015 Rhode Island lagged behind in funding for higher education compared to other states. He indicated that there has been a decline in funding for higher education since the recession, and although some progress has been made with support from Governor Raimondo; Rhode Island still has a long way to go.

Commissioner Purcell turned the conversation over to Dr. Susan LaPanne, Associate Commissioner for Higher Education, Finance and Management, who presented a plan for addressing some of the funding issues.

Dr. LaPanne gave an overview of the 2017 budget:

- The higher education operating budget is around \$1.1 billion dollars both in restricted and unrestricted funds;
- Of the \$1.1 billion dollars, 178M is the state appropriation, which represents about 4.8% of the total state general revenue budget;
- There are 4,296.2 FTE positions in higher education, representing 28% of the total FTE budget for the state.

She then went over the restricted and unrestricted, self-sustaining funds that have an approximate 60/40 split between them:

- Unrestricted funds (\$692M) come from the state and include state appropriations, tuition and fees, and cover the costs of general education;
- Restricted funds (\$472M) cover all expenditures that relate to auxiliary enterprises, such as dining, housing, sponsored research, and other self-sustaining revenue projects.

The recommendation for the state support that is included in this year's budget request is approximately \$11.1M distributed in following manner:

- \$5M at URI
- \$2.2M at RIC
- \$3M at CCRI
- \$1M at the Office of the Postsecondary Commissioner

The recommendation for tuition and mandatory fees will result in a net increase of tuition dollars across the three R.I. Public Institutions of Postsecondary Education of approximately \$20.5M. The impact of the 7% annual tuition increase on a fulltime in-state undergraduate student is approximately \$908 at URI, \$570 at RIC, and \$298 at CCRI.

Board Member Williams asked whether the tuition increase is for one or two years.

Council Chair Foulkes responded that the intention is not to raise it again next year and that the Council on Postsecondary Education recently approved it as a one-time, two-year increase.

Council Member Callahan expressed that she understands the reason for increasing tuition, since postsecondary education is underfunded by the state, but hopes there is still an expectation and a vigorous advocacy for the kind of state support that is necessary going forward.

f. Postsecondary Capital Improvement Plan

Dr. Susan LaPanne provided an overview of the Capital Improvement Plan, which was previously reviewed by the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Council on Postsecondary Education. She reported that the Council on Postsecondary Education has the stewardship of approximately 49.2% of all state property (URI holds approximately 32%, RIC 13%, and CCRI 4%).

This evening the Board is being asked to vote on 53 proposed projects over the course of the next five years. Seventeen of the projects are already approved and are in process, nine are current projects looking for continuation, and fourteen projects are seeking approval for the 2017-2019 timeframe.

The total projected capital cost for the projects for the period of Fiscal year 2017 through Fiscal Year 2022 is approximately \$1.4 billion. Of that amount, \$872M is at the URI, \$462M is at RIC, \$56.5M at CCRI, and \$2.2M at the Office of the Postsecondary Commissioner.

Board Member Bernstein gave kudos to the staff at the Institutions of Postsecondary Education and the Office of the Postsecondary Commissioner for all of the hard work putting the budget together. He also stated for the record that although he is not in agreement with every part of the Capital Improvement Plan, he would be voting to approve it based on the fact that there are so many good projects.

g. Board Resolution Delegating Authority over User Agency Contracts to the Managerial Group at the University of Rhode Island

Sally Maranelli, Facility Security Officer at the University of Rhode Island, explained that URI conducts some classified research for the Department of Defense, which creates the potential for classified discussions. Last year, the Board of Education approved a list of individuals authorized to be included in any classified discussions. This evening the Board is being asked to approve a revised resolution to reflect the removal of former Vice-President, Christina Valentino, and to clarify the exclusion of all Board members with the exception of the Board Chair, Barbara Cottam. All other member of the managerial group at URI remain the same as last year.

7. ACTION ITEMS**Enclosure 7a - Approval of the Concurrent Enrollment Course List**

On a motion duly made by William Foulkes and seconded by Colleen Callahan, it was

VOTED: That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Concurrent Enrollment Course Lists for the Community College of Rhode Island, Rhode Island College, and the University of Rhode Island, for academic year 2017-2018, as presented.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

Enclosure 7b - Approval of the PK-12 Fiscal Year 2018 Capital Budget

On a motion duly made by Karin Forbes and seconded by William Foulkes, it was

VOTED: That, the R.I. Board of Education formally approves the PK-12 Fiscal Year 2018 Capital Budget Request.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

Enclosure 7c - Approval of the PK-12 Fiscal Year 2017 Revised and Fiscal Year 2018 Current Service Level Budgets

On a motion duly made by Colleen Callahan and seconded by Daniel McConaghy, it was

VOTED: That, the R.I. Board of Education formally approves and transmits the PK-12 Fiscal Year 2017 Revised and Fiscal Year 2018 Current Service Level Budgets to the Rhode Island State Budget Office.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

Enclosure 7d - Approval of the Postsecondary Unrestricted and Restricted Budget Requests, Tuition and Fee Rates and Tables of Organization for Fiscal Year 2018-2019 and the Unrestricted and Restricted Budget Allocations for Fiscal Year 2017

On a motion duly made by William Foulkes and seconded by Daniel McConaghy, it was

VOTED:

That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Public Higher Education System's budget request for the 2018 Fiscal Year as presented sending it to the State Budget Office for inclusion in the Governor's Recommended budget, **and further**

That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Public Higher Education System's tuition, mandatory fees, and auxiliary enterprise fees for the 2018 Fiscal Year as presented, sending it to the State Budget Office for inclusion in the Governor's Recommended Budget, but reserving the right to readjust tuition and fees as needed upon notification of the Governor's recommendation and, later, upon the action of the legislature, **and further**

That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Public Higher Education System's Tables of Organization for the 2018 Fiscal Year as presented sending it to the State Budget Office for inclusion in the Governor's Recommended Budget, **and further**

That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Public Higher Education System's budget allocation for the 2017 Fiscal Year as presented, sending it to the State Budget Office for inclusion in the Governor's Recommended Budget.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

Enclosure 7e - Approval of the Postsecondary Capital Improvement Plan for 2018-2022

On a motion duly made by Karin Forbes and seconded by Colleen Callahan, it was

VOTED: That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Postsecondary Capital Improvement Plan for Fiscal Year 2018-2022 as presented and forward it to the State Budget Office for review and inclusion in the Governor's recommended budget.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

Enclosure 7f - Approval of the Board Resolution Delegating Authority over User Agency

On a motion duly made by Jeffery Williams and seconded by Rachelle Green, it was

VOTED: That, the R.I. Board of Education approves the Resolution for the Delegation of Authority over User Agency contracts at the University of Rhode Island.

Vote: 14 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Jo Eva Gaines, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

7. ADJOURNMENT:

On a motion duly made by William Foulkes and seconded by Heather Crosby, it was

VOTED: That, the Rhode Island Board of Education adjourns.

Vote: 13 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Michael Bernstein, Colleen Callahan, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, Karin Forbes, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Thomas Izzo, Daniel McConaghy, Joyce Stevos, and Jeffery Williams

NAYS: 0

[Board Member Gaines departed the meeting at 6:45 p.m.]

The meeting adjourned at 7:17 p.m.