

# Levels of Support for Evidence-Based Practices for English Learners Academic Instruction

(\*empirical study with student-outcome measures)

Essential Components	Recommended Tier(s)	CEEDAR Level of Evidence	Citations
<b>Recommendation 1.0</b>			
<b>Provide Students Opportunity to Develop Academic Oral Language While Simultaneously Teaching Literacy and Other Content Areas</b>			
1.1 - Provide designated time to develop English oral language proficiency as part of Tier 1 core instruction.	1	Limited	August & Shanahan, 2006; Saunders et al., 2006*
1.2 - Provide sheltered instruction practices (e.g., comprehensible input, language objectives) to support student in content-area learning.	1, 2, 3	Moderate Promising (Tiers 2 & 3)	August et al., 2009*; S. Baker et al., 2014; Echevarria et al., 2011*; Echevarria et al., 2012; Vaughn et al., 2009*
1.3 - Use peer-supported instruction and learning for students to practice oral language during academic lessons.	1	Moderate Promising (Tiers 2 & 3)	August et al., 2014; Calhoun et al., 2007*; Cole, 2014; Echevarria et al., 2011*; McMaster et al., 2008*; Richards-Tutor et al., 2015; Sáenz et al., 2005*; Vaughn et al., 2009*
1.4 - Teach explicit comprehension strategies to assist students in accessing content while they are developing English proficiency.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tier1) Strong (Tier 2) Emerging (Tier 3)	August & Shanahan, 2006; August et al., 2009*; Echevarria et al. 2012; A. W. Graves et al., 2011*; A. W. Graves et al., 2010*; Klingner et al., 2012*; Solari & Gerber, 2008*; Vadasy & Sanders, 2010*; Vaughn, Cirino, et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Linan-Thompson, et al., 2006*; Vaughn et al., 2009*; Vaughn, Mathes, et al., 2006*; Vaughn et al., 2011*; Wanzek & Roberts, 2012*

Essential Components	Recommended Tier(s)	CEEDAR Level of Evidence	Citations
<b>Recommendation 2.0</b> <b>Teach Vocabulary Across Content Areas</b>			
2.1 - Provide opportunities for in-depth understanding of words through reading, writing, listening, and speaking.	1, 2, 3	Strong (Tier 1) Moderate (Tier 2) Emerging (Tier 3)	August et al., 2009*; S. Baker et al., 2014; Cena et al., 2013*; Crevecoeur et al., 2014*; Galloway & Lesaux, 2015; Lesaux et al., 2010*; Lesaux et al., 2010*; Nelson et al., 2011*; Silverman, 2007*; Silverman & Hines, 2009*; Snow et al., 2009*; Townsend & Collins, 2009*; Vadasy & Sanders, 2015; Vaughn, Cirino, et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Linan-Thompson, et al., 2006*; Vaughn et al., 2009*; Vaughn, Mathes et al., 2006*; Vaughn et al., 2011*
2.2 - Teach high-utility academic words	1, 2, 3	Strong (Tier 1) Limited (Tier 2)	August, Artzi, & Barr, 2015; S. Baker et al., 2014; Cena et al., 2013*; Crevecoeur et al., 2014*; Lesaux et al., 2010*, 2014*; Nelson et al., 2011*; Proctor et al., 2007; Proctor et al., 2009; Santoro et al., 2006*; Silverman, 2007*; Silverman & Hines, 2009*; Taboada & Rutherford, 2011*;
2.3 - Teach word-learning strategies.	1, 2, 3	Strong (Tier 1) Limited (Tier 2) Emerging (Tier 3)	August et al., 2009*; August et al., 2014; S. Baker et al., 2014; M. F. Graves et al., 2013; Kieffer & Lesaux, 2012; Lesaux et al., 2010*, 2014*; Nelson et al., 2011*; Silverman, 2007*; Silverman & Hines, 2009*; Snow et al., 2009; Taboada & Rutherford, 2011*; Vadasy & Sanders, 2015; Vaughn et al., 2009*; Vaughn et al., 2011*

Essential Components	Recommended Tier(s)	CEEDAR Level of Evidence	Citations
<b>Recommendation 3.0</b>			
<b>Provide Instruction and/or Instructional Support in Primary Language as Needed</b>			
3.1 - Consider transferability of literacy skills for students literate in first language.	1, 2, 3	**empirical base before 2005-2015  Strong** (Tiers 1 & 2) Potential (Tier 3)	August et al., 2014; Dressler & Kamil, 2006; Echevarria et al., 2012, 2017; Francis, Rivera, et al., 2006; Genesee & Geva, 2006
3.2 - Provide students with bilingual programs when possible (including intervention in language of instruction).	1, 2, 3	Strong** (Tier 1) Limited (Tier 2)	August et al., 2014; Francis, Rivera, et al., 2006; Orosco, 2015*; Simon-Cereijido & Gutierrez-Clellen, 2014; Vaughn, Cirino, et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Linan-Thompson, et al., 2006*
3.3 - In English-only instruction, primary language support is useful.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tier 1) Limited (Tier 2)	August et al., 2014; Echevarria et al., 2012; Liang et al., 2005*; Orosco, 2014*
<b>Recommendation 4.0</b>			
<b>Provide Appropriate Interventions for English Learners Who Need Support Beyond Tier 1 Instruction</b>			
4.1 - Provide targeted, small-group explicit interventions at Tier 2 for struggling ELs or Tier 3 for ELs who have intensive need. The interventions should be either (a) developed specifically for ELs or (b) have been determined appropriate for ELs. Interventions should include both foundational skills (e.g., phonological awareness, decoding) and other literacy and language skills.	2, 3	Strong (Tier 2) Emerging (Tier 3)	S. Baker et al., 2014; Begeny et al., 2012*; Cirino et al., 2009*; Gersten et al., 2007; A. W. Graves et al., 2011*; A. W. Graves et al., 2010*; Kim et al., 2015*; O'Connor et al., 2010*; Orosco, 2015; Orosco et al., 2014*; Solari & Gerber, 2008*; Vadasy & Sanders, 2010*; Vaughn, Cirino, et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Linan-Thompson, et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Mathes, et al.,*; Vaughn et al., 2011*; Wanzek & Roberts, 2012*
4.2 - Ensure that interventions include specific strategies to meet the needs of ELs (e.g., oral language development, primary language support, peer support).	2, 3	Strong (Tier 2) Emerging (Tier 3)	Cirino et al., 2009*; A. W. Graves et al., 2011*; A. W. Graves et al., 2010*; Kim et al., 2015*; O'Connor et al., 2010*; Orosco et al., 2014*; Orosco, 2015*; Solari & Gerber, 2008*; Vadasy & Sanders, 2010; Vaughn, Cirino et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Linan-Thompson et al., 2006*; Vaughn, Mathes et al.,*; Vaughn et al., 2011* (Tier 3); Wanzek & Roberts, 2012*
<b>Recommendation 5.0</b>			
<b>Implement Culturally Responsive Instruction (see IC on Culturally Responsive Pedagogy)</b>			

Monitoring Student Progress

Essential Components	Recommended Tier(s)	CEEDAR Level of Evidence	Citations
<b>Recommendation 1.0</b>			
<b>Implement Purposeful and Appropriate Assessment Practices Taking Into Account English Learners' Primary Language, English-Language Proficiency, and Ongoing Linguistic and Academic Progress</b>			
1.1a – Monitor students' primary language proficiency across tiers.	1, 2, 3	Moderate (Tier 1)	August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; Jackson et al., 2014*(T1); Laija-Rodriguez et al., 2006*(T1); Linan-Thompson & Ortiz, 2009; Miller et al., 2006*(T1); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3)
1.1b – Monitor students' English-language proficiency across tiers.	1, 2, 3	Moderate (Tier 1)	August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; A. W. Graves et al., 2011*(T2); Linan-Thompson & Ortiz, 2009; Miller et al. 2006*(T1); Vanderwood et al., 2008*(T1); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3); Yesil-Dagli, 2011*(T1)
1.2 - Monitor students' progress in language of instruction.	1, 2, 3	Strong (Tier 1 & 2)	Al Otaiba et al., 2009*(T1); D. L. Baker et al., 2010* (T1); Domínguez de Ramírez & Shapiro, 2006* (T1); Domínguez de Ramírez & Shapiro, 2007* (T1); Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; Fien et al., 2008*(T1); A. W. Graves et al., 2005* (T1); Keller-Margulis, Payan, & Booth (2012)* T1; Linan-Thompson & Ortiz, 2009, Muyskens et al., 2009*(T1); Ortiz et al., 2011*(T3); Richards-Tutor et al., 2012*(T2); Rinaldi & Samson, 2008; Wiley & Deno, 2005*(T1); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3) [refer to T2 studies cited in Recommendation 4 of Academic Instruction]
1.3 - Monitor students' progress after reclassification to English-proficient status.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tiers 1)	Al Otaiba et al., 2009*(T1); August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Francis, Rivera, et al., 2006; Hopkins et al, 2013; Klingner & Eppolito, 2014
<b>Recommendation 2.0</b>			
<b>Use Curriculum-Based Measurement to Determine Risk and Monitor Progress Across Tiers With English Learners as Part of a School Site or District's Comprehensive MTSS Model</b>			
2.1 - Use tools with demonstrated validity and reliability for ELs to identify and monitor students' need for instructional support and possible special education evaluation.	1, 2, 3	Strong (Tiers 1 & 2)	August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Al Otaiba, et al. 2009*(T1); D. L. Baker et al., 2010*(T1); Betts et al., 2008*(T1); Domínguez de Ramírez & Shapiro, 2006*(T1); Domínguez de Ramírez & Shapiro, 2007*(T1); Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; Fien et al., 2008*(T1); A. W. Graves et al., 2005*(T1); Muyskens et al., 2009*(T1); Richards-Tutor et al., 2012*(T1, T2); Vanderwood et al., 2008*(T1); Wiley & Deno, 2005*(T1); Yesil-Dagli, 2011*(T1); [refer to T2 studies cited in Recommendation 4 of Academic Instruction]

2.2 - Obtain additional formal and informal measures of student performance to clarify progress and ensure appropriate decision making.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tiers 1 & 3)	August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; E. Cho et al., 2014; Hosp et al., 2011*(T1); Knight-Teague et al., 2014*(T1); Linan-Thompson & Ortiz, 2009; Liu et al., 2008*(T3); Quirk & Beem, 2012*(T1); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3)
2.3 - Include additional procedures in universal screening and progress monitoring to ensure appropriate data collection involving ELs.	1, 2, 3	Emerging	Cummings et al., 2014*(T1); Miller et al., 2006*(T1)
2.4 - Build general and special educators' technical capacities to analyze data involving ELs for educational decision-making purposes.	1, 2, 3	Emerging	Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; Menzies et al, 2008
<b>Recommendation 3.0</b> <b>Employ an Ecological Approach When Evaluating English Learners' Possible Learning Difficulties and to Develop Appropriate and Culturally Responsive Supports</b>			
3.1 - Consider multiple variables while explaining ELs' lack of progress.	1, 2, 3	Moderate (Tier 3)	August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Betts et al., 2009*(T1); Kieffer & Vukovic, 2012; Liu et al., 2008*(T3); Ortiz et al., 2011*(T3); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3)
3.2 - Collaborate with qualified educational professionals	1, 2, 3	Emerging (Tier 3)	Garcia & Ortiz, 2008; King Thorius & Simon, 2014; Linan-Thompson & Ortiz, 2009; Martinez et al., 2014; Ortiz et al., 2011*(T3); Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3)
3.3 - Develop comparable peer profiles involving ELs within the school and district for the purpose of making decisions related to instruction, intervention, and referral for special education evaluation.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tiers 1 & 3)	Al Otaiba et al., 2009*(T1); August, Artzi, Kuchle, & Halloran, 2015; Barrera & Liu, 2010; Esparza-Brown & Sanford, 2011; Keller-Margulis, Clemens, et al., 2012*(T1); Ortiz et al., 2011*(T3); Sandberg & Reschly, 2011; Wilkinson et al., 2006*(T3)
3.4 - Monitor short- and long-term progress, and more frequently with ELs experiencing difficulty.	2, 3	Emerging	Gersten et al., 2007; King Thorius & Simon, 2014; Liu et al, 2008*(T3); Martinez et al., 2014

## Family-School Partnerships

<b>Recommendation 1.0: Develop Parent Involvement Programs That Are Carried Out in the Home Language, Are Sustained Over Time, and Are Responsive to the Cultural Experiences of the Families</b>			
1.1 - Provide materials, informational letters, and communication with families in L1.	1, 2, 3	Limited	Araujo, 2009; Auerbach & Collier, 2012; Hardin et al., 2009; Mueller et al. 2009; Yaden et al., 2005
1.2 - Whenever possible, have bilingual staff carry out parent meetings and trainings.	1, 2, 3	Limited	Good et al., 2010; Hardin et al., 2009; O'Donnell & Kirkner, 2014*; Rivera & Lavan, 2012; Tang et al., 2012*
1.3 - Provide accurate and supportive translation to promote parent involvement.	3	Limited	S. Cho & Gannotti, 2005; Hardin et al., 2009; Lo, 2008; Mueller, 2014
1.4 - Consider the concerns, ideas, and cultural resources of parents.	1, 2, 3	Limited	Araujo, 2009; Auerbach & Collier, 2012; Good et al., 2010
1.5 - Provide explicit information to parents about American schools (and especially about special education) as needed.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tier 1) Potential (Tier 2) Limited (Tier 3)	Hughes et al., 2008; O'Donnell & Kirkner, 2014*; Rivera & Lavan, 2012
1.6 - Promote parent-to-parent support group in L1 (for parents of special needs children).	3	Limited	Mueller, 2014; Mueller et al., 2009
<b>Recommendation 2.0: Understand the Out-of-School Experiences of Children and How These May Differ From the Skills Demonstrated at School</b>			
2.1 - Do not assume that there is no literacy use in the homes of low-income and immigrant families when daily book sharing is not a regular activity.	1	Strong	Farr, 2005; Lynch, 2009; Mercado, 2005; Reese, 2009; Reyes & Azuara, 2008; Rodriguez, 2005
2.2 - Encourage L1 reading with children at home.	1	Moderate	Durand, 2011*; Reese & Goldenberg, 2008*; Roberts, 2008*
<b>Recommendation 3.0: Provide Strategies for Parents of English Learners to Enhance the Effectiveness of Parent Involvement Activities</b>			
3.1 - Provide audio versions of books and vocabulary in English for families to use at home	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tier 1) Potential (Tiers 2 & 3)	Cooke et al., 2009*; Kupzyk et al., 2011*
3.2 - Provide L1 materials for home use.	1, 2, 3	Limited (Tier 1) Potential (Tiers 2 & 3)	Yaden et al., 2005

Source: Richards-Tutor, C., Aceves, T., & Reese, L. (2016). Evidence-based practices for English Learners (Document No. IC-18). Retrieved from University of Florida, Collaboration for Effective Educator, Development, Accountability, and Reform Center website:

<http://cedar.education.ufl.edu/tools/innovation-configurations/>